## Agriculture Union National Council Meeting April 15-17, 2005

### Delta St-John's St-John's, Newfoundland

#### **MINUTES**

#### **In Attendance**

National Executive: Yves Ducharme National President

Bob Kingston First National Executive Vice-President
R.S. Panickar Second National Executive Vice-President
Debbie Forsythe Third National Executive Vice-President
Fourth National Executive Vice-President

**Regional Vice-Presidents:** Dawn Aisenstat

(RVPs)

Dawn Aisenstat Manitoba and Nunavut

Gary Dionne Western Ontario

Ron Filteau Southern Saskatchewan

André Grégoire Eastern Quebec Janice Hilton North Western Ontario

Bob Jackson Western British Columbia and Yukon

Steve Kaytor Southern Alberta Allan MacRae Western Atlantic

Ernie Mazepa Northern Alberta and Northwest Territories

Ruth McDiarmid Eastern British Columbia

Fabian Murphy Eastern Atlantic Ian Smith Eastern Ontario Raphael Tarasco Western Quebec

Howard Willems Northern Saskatchewan

**Directors:** Madeleine David Public Service Commission of Canada

Marianne Hladun Equal Opportunities

Jasmine Stroz-Breton Department of National Defence

Staff: Larry Budge Administrative Officer

Elaine Massie Service Officer
Sylvia Prowse Service Officer
Sylvie Rochon Service Officer

**Observers:** Alan Pryde Pryde Communications

#### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by the National President.

#### 2. Opening Remarks

- Yves made some opening remarks and greeted everyone to the meeting;
- Sylvia Prowse read the PSAC Statement on Harassment.

#### 3. Adoption of Agenda

➤ M/S/C – McDiarmid/Jackson – THAT the agenda be adopted.

#### 4. Hours of Session

Proposed hours of session:

#### Friday, April 15/05:

9:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.

1:00 p.m. to 5:00 p.m. - Standing Committees meetings.

#### Saturday, April 16/05:

9:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m.

1:30 p.m. to 5:00 p.m.

#### Sunday, April 17/05:

9:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m. or until completion of business.

> M/S/C - Aisenstat/Smith - THAT the proposed hours of session be adopted.

#### 5. Approval of the November 2004 Council Minutes

Add Gerry Blondin - Service Officer to the list of attendees.

#### Correction - Item 9 - Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada update:

Regarding reclassified positions, take note that <u>some</u> positions were reclassified upwards, not all.

➤ M/S/C – McDiarmid/Smith – THAT the November 2004 Council minutes, including the above mentioned corrections, be approved.

Unanimous - Recorded Vote #1

#### 6. <u>Business Arising out of Minutes</u>

Were are still waiting for the minutes of the June 4/04 meeting with the CPMA.

#### 7. Financial Report

See the attached Finance Standing Committee report.

#### 8. National Office

Yves mentioned that Gerry Blondin plans on retiring in November 2005; Gerry is currently on paid sick leave.

Regarding Beverly Wellon, she is still on LTD leave and we can not get any information as to when she might return.

Yves was happy to announce that Debbie Ramsay has accepted a full time position with our Union.

#### 9. Canadian Food Inspection Agency update

#### BSE program

Council members discussed the Agency's decision to move to a dedicated feed inspection system. This move will bring new jobs and that's good news. However, regional inconsistencies have already been identified regarding who can apply and this is troubling. Because of the importance of this issue, RVP's should request to have special UMC meetings on this matter alone. In May, there will be an update meeting at the national level.

#### Seed Sampling Program

Sylvia Prowse gave a progress report; RVP's that have certified inspectors in this field should provide her with feedback before her next meeting with the Agency.

#### Classification Reviews

Sylvie Rochon gave a progress report; currently there are 11 job descriptions left to do, including two that are considered unique. Sylvie also mentioned that we are looking for grievors in the following three positions: EG-3 Fish Program Inspector (#20134); EG-3 Food Processing Inspector (#20146) and EG-4 Inspection Supervisor (#20147). The next mediation sessions are scheduled for May.

#### Consultation

Yves reported that the National UMC meetings with the Agency were set to resume on May 20/05.

#### 10. Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada

#### EG and GL generic job descriptions

In her update, Sylvia stated there are delays in the Prairie region regarding the EG work description writing tool process; once the data is reviewed in May, a report will follow. As for the effective date, members will be able to grieve it if they are unhappy. As for the update on the GL National review, the department has assigned a new person to the review and the process has been delayed as a result; the department must provide us with more information in order for this matter to proceed.

#### Reclassification of Human Resources

Yves gave a progress report. The new terms of reference were signed they are now being printed up (later in the weekend copies were distributed to interested Council members). With additional meetings still in the works the office will be providing updates as more information become available.

#### Closure of Research Stations

Council members discussed the liberal government's decision to close research stations in Winnipeg, Kapuskasing, Nappan and in St-John's. Members in the Atlantic region were shocked to hear of the Nappan and St-John's closures. Fabian Murphy and Allan MacRae both stated that the decisions were contested immediately by provincial officials and farmer associations. Additionally, a task force has been put place and will lobby the government to reverse its decision.

#### 11. Canadian Grain Commission

Dawn Aisenstat discussed the Commission's plan to cut jobs at the regional office saying that the decision was taken without prior consultation with the union. She and Janice Hilton also stated concerns they have regarding Gordon Miles' latest project, Odyssey 5. In response, Yves stated he will address their concerns at the next NUMC. In the west, Bob Jackson discussed the terminable allowance issue; the valiant effort put on by the members of Local 60 was recognized by Council members.

#### 12. <u>Department of National Defence</u>

Jasmine Stroz-Breton gave Council an update; she noted that a local merger in BC will likely go ahead as planned. Dates for a Health & Safety UMC meeting will be scheduled soon; Denis Sicard, Sylvie Rochon and herself will be attending.

#### 13. <u>Public Service Commission</u>

Madeleine David gave a progress report on the changes at the Commission. The work on new terms of reference is ongoing and the PSC's role in the regions is still unclear. Regarding the new School of the Public Service, transfers have been delayed due to a review of the whole process.

Not seeking re-election at convention, this was Madeleine's last Council meeting and she took the opportunity to thank everyone.

#### 14. Transfers to the Canada Border Services Agency

Yves gave a progress report. In a meeting with Nycole Turmel, Ron Moran and himself, it was agreed that our Union would transfer 19 members, now working at the CBSA, over to CEUDA – Customs Excise Union Douanes Accise. The agreement was in the best interest of our former members as CEUDA already represents a vast majority of CBSA members.

#### 15. Resolutions of Record

Item was referred to By-Laws – see report.

#### 16. AU Structure Committee

Debbie Forsythe gave a progress report and gave Council members another chance to discuss the final recommendations. As mandated by the 2002 convention, all the recommendations will be submitted to the 2005 convention. Therefore, Council members will not get to vote on them until August; as a result they'll be free to speak/vote on them at that time.

#### 17. Communications

Alan Pryde presented our newly launched web site; he later took questions and addressed some of the glitches that were brought to his attention. So far, feedback from the members has been very positive.

#### 18. Agriculture Union 2005 Convention

Fabian Murphy gave a progress report to Council. Several special events such as kitchen parties, boat tours and pub crawls are being planned. He and the host committee are looking forward to August.

#### 19. Regional Rates of Pay

Item was referred to the Finance Committee, see report.

#### 20. Standing Committee Reports

#### Note:

All committee resolutions are deemed to have been moved by the respective Chairperson and seconded by his/ her co-chair.

#### Standing Committee on By-Laws and Education

The co-chair, Ron Filteau presented the report on behalf of the committee, see attached.

- Proposed changes to By-Law 6, Section 7 M/S/C Unanimously - Recorded Vote #2
- Proposed changes to By-Law 12, Section 10 and to By-Law 6, Section 11(b).
  M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #3
- Proposed changes to By-Law 8, Section 10 (3).
   M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #4
- Proposed changes to By-Law 11, Section 3 (1).

#### M/S/C Unanimously - Recorded Vote #5

- Proposed changes to Annex 1 Life Members of Agriculture Union.
   M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #6
- Adoption of the Report of the Standing Committee on By-Laws and Education.
  M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #7

#### Collective Bargaining/Health and Safety Committee

The co-chair, Ian Smith presented the report on behalf of the committee, see attached.

- Convention resolution #1 from the Atlantic Regional Seminar .
   M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #8
- Adoption of the Report of the Collective Bargaining/Health and Safety Committee.
   M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #9

#### **General Committee**

The co-chair, Marianne Hladun presented the report on behalf of the committee, see attached.

- Announcement of the PSAC Unity Conference on our web site.
   M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #10
- Info bulletin to be issued to locals regarding Standardized Tests on staffing.
  M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #11
- Adoption of the Report of the General Committee.
  M/S/C Unanimously Recorded Vote #12

#### **Finance Committee**

The co-chair, Bob Jackson presented the report on behalf of the committee, see attached. The committee's proposed convention budget was then presented by Pani and Bob and was dealt separately. As this was his last Council meeting, Brother Panickar thanked all Council members for the support they've given him while he served 9 years as Executive VP of Finance.

Adoption of the Finance Committee report.
 M/S/C Unanimously - Recorded Vote #13

<u>NOTE</u>: Regarding motion on Regional Rates of Pay. The Council agreed in principle with it since the "first be it resolved" is already a Resolution of Record of the PSAC and that the info requested in the third "be it resolved" is already available. The financial request in the second "be it resolved" was not agree to by Council due to the unlimited nature of the request.

Adoption of the proposed convention budget.
 M/S/C Unanimously - Recorded Vote #14

#### 21. Whistle Blowing Legislation

Yves gave a progress report regarding the PSAC's request for amendments.

#### 22. Next Executive Meeting

All dates in 2005:

August 20 National Executive – Convention business only
August 21 National Council – Convention business only

September 25 National Executive – Ottawa, ON September 26-29 National Council– Ottawa, ON

NOTE: planning session on Sept. 28

#### 23. Question and Answers session

General discussion.

#### 24. Henriette Pollon Life Membership

Henriette Pollon has over 35 years of service with Agriculture Union. She is a founding member and was the first woman elected to the National Executive.

➤ Aisenstat/Willems – That Henriette Pollon be a Life Member of Agriculture Union.
M/S/C Unanimously - Recorded Vote #15

#### **Adjournment**

➤ M/S/C – Smith/MacRae – THAT the meeting be adjourned.

Minutes submitted by,

Larry Budge

Administrative Officer

# Report of the Standing Committee On By-Laws and Education April 15-17, 2005

#### **Members:**

Debbie Forsythe – Chairperson

Ronald Filteau – Secretary, RVP Southern Saskatchewan

Madeleine David Director National CFP-CSPS Ernie Mazepa RVP North Alta and NWT

Ruth McDiarmid RVP Eastern BC

The committee met and discussed the following issues:

#### By-Law 6 Section 7

- The National Council shall hold meetings at least twice annually at the call of the National President or at any time if requested by twelve (12) or more members of the National Council. Meetings of the National Council shall be held in those locations where it is economically feasible and where the interest of the Agriculture Union is most efficiently served. A recorded vote shall be taken on all motions and a copy of same attached to the minutes.
- 2. The National Executive shall hold meetings at least annually at the call of the National President or at any other time if requested by three (3) or more members of the National Executive. <u>Meetings of the National Executive shall be held in those locations where it is economically feasible and where the interest of the Agriculture Union is most efficiently served.</u>

Moved by Ruth McDiarmid RVP Eastern BC Seconded by Ernie Mazepa RVP North Alta and NWT

## By-Law 12 Finances Section 10 and By-Law 6 National Council and National Executive Section 11 (b)

**So Be it resolved** that funds for non-budgeted monetary item / items which are brought to the Agriculture Union for consideration can be dispersed by the Agriculture Union National Executive if the amount does not exceed \$5000.00 ( Five Thousand) per item not to exceed a maximum amount of \$15,000 (Fifteen Thousands) per annum.

**Be It further resolved** that if the said amount is in excess of \$5000.00 (Five thousand) per item or upon reaching the maximum amount \$15,000 (Fifteen Thousands) per annum the request must be brought to the Agriculture Union National Council for approval with a two-third (2/3) majority vote.

Moved by Ruth McDiarmid RVP Eastern BC Seconded by Ernie Mazepa RVP North Alta and NWT

#### By-Law 8 Section 10 (3)

**Be it resolved that** Before March 1<sup>st</sup> of each year, the Treasurer shall submit to the Administrative Officer of the union a copy of the local's audited annual financial statement signed by a least 2 local members. These members shall not be signing officers of the local.

Moved by Madeleine David Director National CFP-CCMD Seconded by Ruth McDiarmid RVP Eastern BC

#### By-Law 11 Section 3 (1)

**Be it resolved that** the National Convention shall deal with all resolutions and matters brought before it from Local Meetings, Regional Conferences, National Council or the National Executive of this Union.

Moved by Madeleine David Director National CFP-CCMD Seconded by Ernie Mazepa RVP North Alta and NWT

Agriculture Union By-Law Annex 1 Life Members of Agriculture Union P.S.A.C.

**Be it resolved that** to preserve the history of this great Union a separate page in its By-Laws Annex 1a be allotted to the former life members of the Agriculture Union who are deceased

**Be it further resolved that** when a life member is deceased the amount of time she/he was a member and the year of demise should also be mentioned next to the deceased member's name.

Moved by Ruth McDiarmid RVP Eastern BC Seconded by Madeleine David Director National CFP-CCMD The following two resolutions of recorded are to be removed as the intent is already covered in the By-Laws.

#### National Executive Officers' Financial Expenditures Report

1984/C-24 **BE IT RESOLVED THAT** National Executive Officers report at year end to each local their financial expenditures for that year with respect to loss of wages, overtime compensation and travel expenses.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT** Regional Vice-Presidents report similarly to the locals in their respective Regions

#### **Financial Statements and Reports**

1981/C-29 **BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the financial statements and the reports presented at the National Council meetings be presented exactly in the same concept and in the same way at the Triennial National Convention of our Union.

The election for co-chair of the resolutions committee on By-Laws for convention was held and Ronald H. Filteau was elected.

#### Report of the Bargaining and Occupational Health & Safety Committee April 15, 2005

Bob Kingston (Chair) Ian Smith (Co-Chair) Howard Willems Fabian Murphy Gary Dionne

#### Resolutions

Item #1 - Discussion of Convention Resolution #1 submitted from the Atlantic Regional Seminar (see attachment svp):

The committee discussed and endorsed this resolution.

*Motion by* Fabian Murphy

Seconded by Howard Willems

That the members receive interest on back pay and that the resolution be submitted by the National Council with the CB and OSH's proposal of **concurrence**.

Item #2 – Discussion on Resolution #2 submitted by the Atlantic Regional Seminar (see attachment svp):

The committee feels this is a Local jurisdiction issue and are not prepared to adopt at this level and is inclined to send it back to the founding body for new language prior to resubmission.

#### Strike Action

PSAC has announced that there will be a debriefing of the Collective Bargaining Committees and Regional Strike Structures. If you participated in a bargaining table or regional strike structure you may be contacted to participate in a debriefing meeting.

#### Occupational H & S Standing Committee Recommendations

Item #1 – The CB would like to recommend a modular training system similar to that adopted by the AAFC NOSH and that all departments and all employers adopt such a system via NOSH Committees.

It is presently inclusive of three major modules which are:

- 1) Training for Committee Members
- 2) Training for Supervisors and Managers
- 3) Training for Employees

Item #2 – Discussion on Policy/Reg/Area Committees – that Area and Regional Committees are Policy Committees where they exist, and appointments to them must be made by the appropriate level of Union representative, and their duties and responsibilities are found in CLC 134.1 s.s.7.

#### CONVENTION RESOLUTION

#### Submitted by

#### Atlantic Regional Seminar

For consideration by the

#### 13<sup>th</sup> TRIENNIAL NATIONAL CONVENTION

of the

#### AGRICULTURE UNION - PSAC

#### Resolution No. 1

Subject matter: Feasibility of Interest on Retroactive Pay

WHEREAS the current process of negotiations applies minimal fiscal pressure on the Employer to negotiate a timely agreement; and

WHEREAS once settlements are reached, retroactive pay is dispersed to our members without interest on retroactive pay; and

WHEREAS other Unions have won the right for interest on retroactive pay;

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the PSAC investigate the feasibility of requiring interest to be paid on retroactive pay from the Employer on contract settlements through legal, negotiated or other actions.

Signed by:

Fabian Murphy – RVP Eastern Atlantic Allan MacRae – RVP Western Atlantic

#### CONVENTION RESOLUTION

#### Submitted by

#### Atlantic Regional Seminar

For consideration by the

#### 13<sup>th</sup> TRIENNIAL NATIONAL CONVENTION

of the

#### AGRICULTURE UNION – PSAC

#### Resolution No. 2

Subject matter: Amendment to Section 24, Sub-section 7

WHEREAS unions attempt to have all members support a common cause while providing strength through members; and

WHEREAS the PSAC and the Agriculture Union are committed to improving the working environment of their members and continually work toward eliminating workplace conflicts; and

WHEREAS the PSAC and the Agriculture Union continually fights to have their members treated equally regardless of their situation; and

WHEREAS many locals have established Strike Funds, through increase membership dues currently being collected by the employer through payroll deductions, to help members through hardship caused by strike actions.

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Section 24, Sub-Section 7 of the PSAC Constitution be amended to ensure the 25% remittance from designates does not result in less take home pay than non-designates of equal classifications within their local.

Signed by:

Fabian Murphy – RVP Eastern Atlantic Allan MacRae – RVP Western Atlantic

#### Report of the General Standing Committee April 15, 2005

Denis Sicard – Chair 4<sup>th</sup> NEVP André Gregoire – RVP Eastern Quebec Janice Hilton – RVP Northwestern Ontario Jasmine Stroz-Breton – Director DND Raphaël Tarasco – RVP Western Quebec Marianne Hladun – Director Equal Opportunities

#### **Equal Opportunities Committee Report**

- Presentations have been made at most Regional Seminars;
- Five resolutions have been presented to most Regional Seminars;
- Regional EO Reps have been fulfilling their mandate of attending local meetings to make presentations on the role of equal opportunities;
- Regional Reps have submitted 2005 regional workplans which were rolled up into a national workplan by the National Director. All workplans were submitted to the National Executive for review and were approved at the February National Executive meeting;
- The committee previously identified maintaining momentum as a challenge so a conference call was held in February and another is scheduled for May.

#### **PSAC** Unity Conference

- The application form for the PSAC Unity Conference is now posted on the PSAC website. The deadline for applications is 4:00 p.m. on May 11, 2005. The conference will be held on September 23-25, 2005 in Halifax. Delegates must self-identify as either Aboriginal (including First Nations, Metis and Inuit) or Racially Visible. Some observer seats may be available and applicants are encouraged to indicate their willingness to attend as an observer and seek funding later.

Moved by Marianne Hladun Seconded by Janice Hilton,

That a notice be posted on the Agriculture Union website announcing the conference, the deadline for applications and also the link to the PSAC application form.

#### PSAC National Women's Conference

Four delegates represented the Agriculture Union at the PSAC National Women's Conference held in Vancouver in February. Several other Agriculture members attended the conference on behalf of their region or their Regional Women's Committee. A caucus meeting was held for all Agriculture delegates and observers with the agenda including a discussion on how the EO Committee fits into the structure and what activities are being undertaken. A group photo was also taken. Some reports have been received from delegates and observers attending the conference and more are expected shortly.

#### Use of Standardized Tests for Staffing

- The committee members had an open discussion on what the Agriculture Union could do to address the concerns of members regarding the use or misuse of standardized tests for staffing purposes.

Moved by Janice Hilton Seconded by Raphaël Tarasco,

That an InfoBulletin be issued to locals explaining our position on the use of standardized tests and also explaining the steps to file complaints.

While it was recognized that the employers are responsible to provide training to employees on staffing, it was also discussed that National Council should receive training from PSC on what the tests were actually designed to achieve as well as how they are done and what members can do to prepare for the testing. The committee felt that this information would allow the Agriculture Union to better represent the membership.

Committee adjourned.

#### **Report of the Finance Committee**

April 15, 2005

Members Present:

Pani Panikar – Chair Bob Jackson- Secretary Dawn Aisenstat Allan MacRae Steve Kaytor Larry Budge

#### **Communications**

Alan Pryde will attend the council meeting April 16<sup>th</sup> to discuss the new website and answer any questions.

When a request for feedback on an issue is sent from the National Office, members are reminded to respond within the time period specified in the original request. The council is reminded to please acknowledge the emails that are sent from National Office.

#### **Finance**

The Executive has reviewed and approved the draft audited Financial Statement. One finalized, this report will be sent to all locals.

Total members 8166 as of February, 2005

**New Meal Rates** 

Breakfast 12.20 Lunch 11.75 Supper 32.65 Incid. 17.30

Total 73.90

#### Rand <u>Deductees</u>

We have 579 rand decuctees as of February, 2005. The committee reminds the council to have signed rand cards sent into Christine Gauthier. Please send the membership cards to Christine who will update our lists and then pass along the PSAC.

#### Travel

The travel policy has been distributed to all council members. A revised policy will be issued with Air Canada's updated fare structure by April 17th.

The committee discussed the budget for 2006, 2007,2008. The chair of the committee will present the budget to the council.

#### Convention

Bob Jackson was selected co-chair of the Finance committee for the convention.

National Council April 2005 Conseil National Avril 2005

#### **Recorded Votes/Votes Consignés**

|              | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|----|----|----|----|----|
| Aisenstat    | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| David        | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Dionne       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Filteau      | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Forsythe     | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 4  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Grégoire     | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Hilton       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Hladun       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 3  | 1  |
| Jackson      | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Kaytor       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Kingston     | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 4  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| MacRae       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Mazepa       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| McDiarmid    | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Murphy       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 4  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Panickar     | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Sicard       | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Smith        | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Stroz-Breton | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Tarasco      | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Willems      | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |
| Ducharme     | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  | 1  |

1=yes/pour 2=no/non 3=abstain/abstention 4=absent